

## Appendix I

### Position on developments in the TAN8 SSAs in the light of the letter by John Griffiths AM of July 2011

- 1 It will be important to the inquiry to have a clear position as to how the letter sent out by the Minister, John Griffiths AM, in July 2011 relates to the current position in the SSAs across Wales, with obvious particular relevance to Areas B and C. That letter was founded on the revised targets set out initially in the Energy Policy Statement of March 2010 and later taken in to the updated Planning Policy Wales.
- 2 The figures that are referred to in the July 2011 letter as being the revised capacities for each of the SSAs are derived from a report by Garrad Hassan (June 2005 – Energy Assessment of TAN8 Wind Energy Strategic Areas) which examined the capacity of the areas set out in the 2004 draft of TAN8, and came up with a total of 1666MW. The figures subsequently published in TAN8 for each of the SSAs are set out in Table 1 in paragraph 2.5 of TAN8 as being a straight one-third reduction of the Garrad Hassan figures – a figure in total of 1,120MW. This appears to have been done as the Welsh Government was only looking for 800MW of additional onshore wind from the SSAs by 2010, and TAN8 stated that the 1120MW figure would allow local discretion in identifying the best sites. The letter from Mr Griffiths reverts precisely to the Garrad Hassan figures for every SSA. For ease of reference the Garrad Hassan and TAN8 figures for the seven SSAs are as follows:

**Table 1: Guideline wind energy capacity in the seven Strategic Search Areas**

SSA	Garrad Hassan (used by Mr Griffiths)	TAN8
Area A	212MW	140MW
Area B	430MW	290MW
Area C	98MW	70MW
Area D	212MW	140MW
Area E	152MW	100MW
Area F	430MW	290MW
Area G	132MW	90MW

- 3 It should be noted that the figures prepared by Garrad Hassan were specifically only for the **broad** capacity of each of the areas defined in what became the published TAN8 SSA and did not include any assessment of the possible resource within the 5km buffer zones around each SSA boundary, which were intended to provide opportunities for refinement of the SSA boundary by more detailed studies. This has implications in the case of Area B in the case of Carno, but more critically in the case of Area C for the way in which the current Llandinam wind farm **may be** is treated.
- 4 The current position in each of the SSAs has been assessed using a wide range of published data and information that has been prepared for a series of recent wind farm inquiries taking into account the Brechfa West and Mynydd y Gwair decisions which have recently been issued. The Inspector may wish to be informed about the position in respect of the other SSAs if the DECC approach is to see how a shortfall in some of the SSAs may need to be made up in others in order to reach the overall figure of 1,666MW promulgated in PPWales by the target dates set down.
- 5 For each of the SSAs the installed capacity of the schemes that were consented prior to TAN8 and post-TAN8 has been calculated, as these together provide a figure for each SSA for the purposes of the PPWales figure and Griffiths totals for each SSA. The results are displayed in Table 2. Schemes that straddle the TAN 8 SSA boundaries have been included, but sites that lie entirely outside an SSA as defined in TAN8 have been excluded. Thus Carno (Area B) and Mynydd y Betws (Area E) have been included but Ferndale, Mynydd Portref and Taff Ely which lie beyond the boundaries of Area F have been excluded (these latter three schemes total 24.8MW). The complication in respect of the current Llandinam wind farm, which has already been highlighted by the Inspector in the letter from PINS dated 10 April, is that it clearly lies outside the TAN8 boundary for Area C but **as amended** it ~~largely~~ falls within the latest version of the refined boundary for Area C in the April 2008 report by ARUP (Local Refinement of TAN8 Strategic Search Areas B and C – Review Exercise). Since the Griffiths letter refers to the SSAs as set out in TAN8 of 2005, and not to refinement exercises carried out, and the Garrad Hassan study on which Griffiths relies also refers only to the SSA boundaries from 2005, it is logical to make the initial assessment of commitments in each SSA against the 2005 boundaries. It will then be a matter for evidence at the hearing session from the relevant parties for the Area C proposals to make their own submission as to the implications this has for the target figures for that SSA.
6. The detailed data in table 2 are summarised in table 3 at the end of this paper.

**Table 2: wind energy capacity in the seven SSAs, consented before and after the publication of TAN8 in 2005**

<b>Area A</b>	Consented prior to TAN8	Tir Mostyn	21.3MW	Total 21.3MW
	Consented post-TAN8	Wern Ddu	9.2MW	
		Llyn Brenig	40MW	
		Derwydd Bach	23MW	
		Nant Bach	27.5MW	Total 99.7MW
	<b>Overall Area A</b>			<b><u>121MW</u></b>
<b>Griffiths figure</b>			<b><u>212MW</u></b>	
<b>Area B</b>	Consented prior to TAN8	Carno A	33.6MW	
		Mynydd y Cemmaes	15.3MW	
		Mynydd Clogau	14.5MW	Total 63.4MW
	Consented post-TAN8	Carno B	15.6MW	
		Tir Gwynt	27.7MW	Total 43.3MW
	<b>Overall Area B</b>			<b><u>106.7MW</u></b>
<b>Griffiths figure</b>			<b><u>430MW</u></b>	
<b>Area C</b>	Consented prior to TAN8		None*	
	Consented post-TAN8		None	Total: 0 MW
	<b>Overall Area C</b>			<b><u>0 MW</u></b>
<b>Griffiths figure</b>			<b><u>98MW</u></b>	
<i>*This excludes Llandinam (30.9MW) for the reasons sets out above</i>				
<b>Area D</b>	Consented prior to TAN8	Mynydd Gorddu	10.2MW	Total 10.2MW
	Consented post-TAN8		None	Total: 0 MW
		<b>Overall Area D</b>		
	<b>Griffiths figure</b>			<b><u>211MW</u></b>

**Table 2 (continued):**

<b>Area E</b>	Consented prior to TAN8		None	Total: 0 MW
	Consented post-TAN8	Mynydd y Betws	34.5MW	
		Maesgwyn	26MW	
		Mynydd y Gwair	48MW	Total 108.5MW
				<b><u>Overall Area E</u></b>
			<b><u>Griffiths figure</u></b>	<b><u>152MW</u></b>
<b>Area F</b>	Consented prior to TAN8	Ffynnon Oer	32MW	Total 32MW
	Consented post-TAN8	Mynydd Bwlffa	22.5MW	
		Pant y Wal	25MW	
		Fforch Nest	27.5MW	
		Maerdy	24MW	
		Pen y Cymoedd	250.8MW *	Total 359.7MW
				<b><u>Overall Area F</u></b>
			<b><u>Griffiths figure</u></b>	<b><u>430MW</u></b>
<b>Area G</b>	Consented prior to TAN8		None	Total: 0 MW
	Consented post-TAN8	Blaengwen	23MW	
		Brechfa West	84MW	Total: 107MW
				<b><u>Overall Area G</u></b>
			<b><u>Griffiths figure</u></b>	<b><u>132MW</u></b>

\* With 3.3 MW turbines. The Section 36 Electricity Act consent refers to 299MW which is the maximum set out in the application before a number of turbines were deleted at the request of the Councils. The figure of 250.8MW relates to the 76 remaining turbines at the 3.3MW rated capacity it is understood that the applicants intend to use.

**Table 3: summary of wind energy capacity in the seven SSAs, consented before and after the publication of TAN8 in 2005**

---

<b>Area</b>	<b>Pre TAN8</b>	<b>Post TAN8</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Griffiths figure</b>
A	21.3MW	99.7MW	121MW	212MW
B	63.4MW	36.3MW	106.7MW	430MW
C	None	None	None	98MW
D	10.2MW	None	10.2MW	212MW
E	None	108.5MW	108.5MW	152MW
F	32MW	359.7MW	391.7MW	430MW
G	None	107MW	107MW	132MW

---