

Thursday 3rd October 2013

Richard Bonfield, Lexington Court, Kerry, Newtown Powys SY16 4LU

Proof of Evidence to the Public Inquiry re 5 wind farm applications and one 132kV line application

My proof was dated 6 August and my objections are based on the headings in my proof

This is my personal submission to the Inquiry
It is indeed the first Public Inquiry I have ever attended

Background

I moved to Lexington Court in 1986. I was Corporate Banking Manager for Midland Bank/HSBC from 1988 to 1997. My role covered Mid Wales for the bank where amongst my clients was a London stock exchange fully listed plc in addition to many large private companies across Mid Wales that banked with Midland Bank/HSBC

From 1997 to March 2012 I was Mid Wales Manger for Xenos Business Angel Network

Jan 1991 to March 1993 - I was CBI Mid Wales Area Chairman

Firstly I object to all 3 wind farms in this Inquiry located within Area C

I am also concerned that the four of the five wind farms will depend on the provision of new connections to a new National Grid substation and 400kV line as set out in the case for the Alliance – that they should have been included in this Inquiry. From a lay person's perspective just how can you evaluate only part and not the whole?

I appreciate that this has been refused but whilst this Inquiry goes on – people in Mid Wales are faced with further information from both SP Manweb and National Grid with ongoing consultations when in reality TODAY 3 October 2013 none will be required as no consented wind farm requires any connection

Tan 8 I fully support the Alliance submission that this technical advice is legally invalid

- Drawn up in the early millennium and made Welsh Government policy in 2005 despite WG not having energy devolved to them
- No consultation whatsoever with people living in Mid Wales who will be impacted. No public notices were ever put in local papers that cover the region ie County Times, Shropshire Star and Cambrian News.

- Area C was initially limited to 90MW out of a total 800MW but at a stroke in Feb 2011 the overall Tan 8 figure was increased 2000 MW of which 1666 was for onshore wind
- For the ordinary person in Mid Wales the position only came to light when National Grid announced their intentions for a sub station and 400kV pylons in January 2011 . This triggered protests across Mid Wales as people were only then just getting the information as to the magnitude of the wind farm industrialisation programme.
- Indeed Capita Symons independent report commissioned by WG stated that this would be the biggest infrastructure project ever seen in Wales
- This culminated in the largest mass protest at the Senedd in May 2011 where nearly 2000 people from Mid Wales converged on the capital
- This protest lead to the First Minister stating that he would only allow the original Tan 8 capacities – clearly unaware that his Minister for Planning and the Environment had increased the target – again with no public notices or consultation.
- Tan 8 through Arup and Garrad Hassan never considered the implications of Traffic, any cost benefit analysis, Strategic Environmental Assessments or socio-economic benefits and certainly no requirement for National Grid substation and 400kV line
- Peter Davies , Welsh Sustainable Futures Commissioner comments made at a Renewable Wales Network conference in 2011 when addressing Tan 8 and windfarm development “ Unmitigated disaster that we have tried to do in Mid Wales “
- I now believe that if the whole process was subject to a Judicial Review Tan 8 would be declared invalid and any wind farm applications would have to be assessed on their own merits without the comfort of being within a Tan 8 area

I would add that at this Inquiry legal representatives representing wind farm developers have had differing interpretations especially at the end of initial opening days in June where the Inspector parked the issue for later in the Inquiry

We now have the United Nations Economic Commission in Geneva , stating that the UK has flouted Article 7 of the Aarhus Convention , which requires full effective public participation on all environmental issues and demands that citizens are given the right to participate in the process CLEARLY Tan 8 has breached this convention.

David Hart QC , an environmental lawyer believes that consents for further wind farms will now be challenged

Glyn Davies MP for Montgomeryshire has written to the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change stating that this Inquiry should be halted on legal grounds until the legal process and position with Article 7 is clarified

Administration of the PI

I am concerned that the administration of this Inquiry is so overwhelming that people who have registered objections are not being advised as to dates / events and even the current programme

My email to Robert Pridham DECC dd 25 July 13 refers

- Evening session at Dolfor on 10th October not being advertised
- Kerry Community Council Proof – when will this be heard?
- Inquiry should have been on an individual windfarm basis and not topic basis
- No transcription of the PI whilst the PI at Legacy was transcribed.
Amazed that the largest UK Public Inquiry into wind farms is not being recorded

Landscape

I will elaborate on my 6th August letter particularly with the Kerry Ridgeway and Two Tumps

And the comment by Dr Jonathan Edis –Expert Witness for Celt Power when responding to myself re view from Two Tumps to the proposed Llandinam re-powering

Whilst the proposed 132kV connection from the proposed Llandinam re-powering to Welshpool Sub station will be dealt with in 2014 – my comment will relate to a recent meeting held with Steven Edwards Senior Environmental Planner for SP Manweb

Noise

As this topic will be covered next week I will make observations on the Cotton Farm Wind Farm Permanent Noise Monitoring Exercise

Plus

- Low frequency hum that can be audible for more than a mile
- Impact of pulsating sound , a phenomenon called “ amplitude modulation (AM) Estimate that 20% of wind farms suffer from AM

Jobs

Now proven wind farms are not the panacea of job creation in the UK
Certainly in Denmark, Holland, Germany, Scandinavia, China etc where 90% of turbine parts come from

As we only have one major UK Energy Company – no surprise that parts are sourced outside the UK

Traffic & Economic Implications

- I will make comment on the meeting held at Newtown Football Club on 18th January 2012 which I chaired
- Response to Celt Power SEI re section 9 Traffic but acknowledge that this will be covered later in the Inquiry

Need

My conclusion for the last 3 years is that the need for the Mid Wales wind farms project including National Grid proposals and SP Manweb proposed connections to the NG hub – that renewable energy produced will be so small in comparison the enormous cost and damage to Mid Wales landscape and its economy that they all should be refused based on:-

European Directive on Renewable Energy “ *steps to increase use of electricity from renewable sources must be in proportion to the objective achieved* ”

The UK Renewable Energy Strategy (2009) “ *while ensuring that we continue to protect our environment and natural heritage respond to legitimate concerns of local communities . Clearly we do not want to see large scale renewable deployment in places where it is inappropriate* ”

People in Mid Wales are against the applications that form this Inquiry as demonstrated by the County Times Petition where 7668 people are saying NO

I contend that both directives clearly demonstrate the position in Mid Wales that neither of these directives are being met.

- Tony Hayward former chief executive of BP
- Germany is embarking on 23 new coal fired power stations Green house gases grew 1.6% in 2012 to ensure their industries will not be impacted as they switch from Nuclear
- CO 2 emissions from UK only amount to 2% of the world output
- In 2010 China and USA combined accounted for more than 40% EU figure is about 12%
- China’s annual increase in CO2 is greater than UK’s total output
- In 2010 global coal consumption reached over 7000 million tonnes
- George Osborn this week is now saying enough is enough UK should not lead the World on Climate as why should we go on inflicting green taxes on business and the public when other countries are not
- Wind farms require back up Rupert Steele regulation director at Scottish power states that 30GW of wind requires 25 GW of back up

- Now reported that National Grid to keep our lights on would be to looking hook up with diesel generators
- Back up through fossil fuels will not only be expensive but will increase our CO2 emissions.
- Based on a memorandum submitted by WRB Bowie (Wind 59) HC 517 The Economics of Wind Power to Parliament (10th July 2012) he states that with back up required noting that Dr Paul Golby CEO of E.On.Uk says 90% is required – results in not only added cost but showing little or no savings in CO2 (based on 25% capacity)

Finally

How can we rely on an inefficient and costly wind farms where the only winners are the developers themselves and land owners through massive subsidies

In 2010 winter wind farms hardly contributed any electricity to our energy needs. Indeed this year for several hours on 19th February almost no electricity was produced and on 124 occasions between Nov 2008 and Dec 2010 only 0.04% contribution was achieved

I reiterate last paragraph in my proof that you sir , as the Inspector for this major public inquiry will recommend that the damage to Mid Wales in its landscape and economy far out weighs the small benefits of producing inefficient energy that these three wind farms be recommended for refusal

Richard Bonfield
3 October 2013